



## Library Research Award Evaluation Criteria

	Points Awarded
<b>Use of information in the project:</b> Up to 20 points	
<b>Search strategy in the essay:</b> Up to 20 points	
<b>Evaluation of sources in the essay:</b> Up to 20 points	
<b>Variety and quality of sources in the bibliography:</b> Up to 16 points	
<b>Evidence of implementation of the search strategy:</b> Up to 8 points	
<b>Citation style in the bibliography:</b> Up to 8 points	
<b>Quality of presentation:</b> Up to 8 points	
<b>TOTAL</b>	

### Use of Information in the Project (20 / 100 points)

Up to 20 points are given for how you used information resources in your project.

To earn **20 points**, the project must meet the following criteria:

- Sources are all clearly identified.
- Sources are integrated into project clearly, original work has been done, and the distinction between the two is always clear.
- Quotes are used appropriately and clearly contribute to the argument.

A project earning **15 points** meets the following criteria:

- Most sources are identified, but one or two are not identified clearly.
- Most sources are integrated into the project clearly, and the line between original work and sources is clear, but there are a few exceptions.
- Quotes are almost always used correctly but there are one or two exceptions.

A project earning **10 points** meets the following criteria:

- Sources are identified, but not consistently.
- The line between sources and original thought is blurry.
- Quotes used poorly most of the time (sometimes used correctly, but only rarely).

A project earning **5 points** meets the following criteria:

- Sources are not clearly identified.
- There are no original thoughts presented in the project.
- Quotes are used inappropriately (i.e., too many, random, do not support argument, out of context).

## Essay (40 / 100 points)

### Search Strategy

Up to 20 points are given for the quality of the search strategy described in the essay.

To earn **20 points**, the description of the search strategy in the essay must meet the following criteria:

- Research question is defined, and its connection to the search is clearly indicated.
- Correctly identifies all types of information needed (e.g., books, peer-reviewed articles, primary sources).
- Describes all of the appropriate tools for this search. Subject relevant databases and tools are all identified.
- There are multiple searches attempted, and there is critical thinking involved in figuring out how to improve on previous searches.
- Identifies necessary information that is not readily available; uses ILL and other methods.

A search strategy earning **15 points** meets the following criteria:

- Research question is defined, but the connection between question and search is not well understood.
- Correctly identifies most types of resources needed, but there is one key type that is missing.
- Most tools needed are identified and used, but there are one or two that are missing.
- Multiple searches are attempted, and there is some effort made to improve on previous searches. However, there are some clear improvements that are not attempted.
- Identifies information not readily available; does not use ILL to obtain it.

A search strategy earning **10 points** meets the following criteria:

- Research question is incomplete (parts missing or too broad / narrow).
- Some correct types of resources needed are identified, but not many.
- Uses a few search tools, but they are not appropriate for the information needed.
- Multiple searches are attempted but there is no effort made to improve on previous searches.
- Use only easy-to-find information.

A search strategy earning **5 points** meets the following criteria:

- The research question is not defined.
- No resource types are identified (or they are misidentified).
- Use only one or two basic tools (Google Scholar, Academic Search Complete).
- Only one search is ever attempted.
- Uses only easy-to-find information.

## Evaluation of Sources

Up to 20 points are given for articulating how you chose your sources.

To earn **20 points**, an essay must articulate clear criteria for evaluating sources, such as:

- Relevance
- Authority
- Scope
- Accuracy
- Currency
- Context
- Bias / viewpoints

An essay earning **15 points** has clear criteria for evaluating sources, but one or two key criteria are missing.

An essay earning **10 points** articulates a set of evaluation criteria, but misses more than two important criteria.

An essay earning **5 points** or less does not clearly define how resources are evaluated.

## Bibliography (32 / 100 points)

### Appropriateness and Quality of Sources

Up to 16 points are distributed depending on the appropriateness and quality of the sources cited in the bibliography.

To earn **16 points**, the bibliography must meet the following criteria:

- All sources used in the project appear in the bibliography.
- A variety of appropriate sources are included.
- Sources are all appropriate (see Evaluation of Sources).

A bibliography earning **12 points** meets the following criteria:

- There is some variety in source type, but at least one type of source that should be included is missing.
- Most sources are appropriate, but there are one or two exceptions.

A bibliography earning **8 points** meets the following criteria:

- There is little variety in source type.
- Some sources are appropriate but many are not.

A bibliography earning **4 points** meets the following criteria:

- Only one type of source used.
- Sources do not show evidence of having been evaluated.

## **Evidence of Essay**

Up to 8 points are given for evidence in the bibliography that you used the search strategy described in the essay.

**8 points:** Throughout the bibliography, it is clear that the methods described in the essay were implemented. This includes the types of sources used, and the methods of evaluating them.

**6 points:** Most of the claims in the essay that can be observed in the bibliography are observed, but there are one or two exceptions.

**4 points:** There is some evidence that the essay was implemented in practice, but there are many exceptions

**2 points:** There is no evidence that the strategy described in the essay was implemented in practice.

## **Citations**

Up to 8 points are given for the consistency and accuracy of your citations.

**8 points:**

- Citations are in a consistent and appropriate style.
- Citations are accurate and complete and can be found.

**6 points:**

- Consistent style, but there may be one or two exceptions, or the style may not be appropriate to the discipline
- All citations can be found and are accurate. Some may be missing information.

**4 points:**

- Some consistency of style, but there are exceptions
- Some incomplete or inaccurate citations. Most citations can be found

## **Quality of Presentation (8 / 100 points)**

**8 points:** Quality of the presentation is consistently high, assisting comprehension of the material easier.

**6 points:** The presentation is at least neutral. While there may be a few cases where the presentation makes the material more difficult, these are rare exceptions.

**4 points:** Quality of presentation is very poor, with egregious errors, impeding comprehension of the material